Social Protection for Africa
A defining force in the 21st century

Dr. Candace Miller candace@bu.edu http://www.bu.edu/cghd/
Agenda

- Context of poverty in sub Saharan Africa
- Social Protection
  - Definitions
  - Theoretical underpinnings
- Players and programs
- Challenges
- Looking forward over the next century...
Context

Poverty, demography, informal economy, geography, environment, health risks
Widespread Poverty in Africa, as indicated by

**Health**
- Infant mortality
- Child mortality
- Malnutrition
- Life expectancy
- HIV prevalence
- Water, vector born diseases

**Human Development**
- Education
- Literacy
- Employment
- Fertility
- Child work
- Child marriage

**Economy**
- GDP
- Consumption
- Growth
- Production
- Labor force participation
- Unemployment
- Infrastructure
- Electricity access
- Technology

**Poverty Resources**
- World Bank, UN Data Portal
- MDGmonitor.org
- TED Talks Hans Rosling
- Illness
- Disability
- Many dependents
- No work available
- Seasonal shocks
Need a response to

- Chronic vulnerability
  - Demographic characteristics or life-cycle events
  - Orphanhood, illness, disability, old age

- Transitory vulnerability
  - Livelihood, environmental shocks (e.g., harvest failures)

- Structural vulnerability
  - Market failures, structural unemployment, social exclusion, political marginalization
Social Security Protection Throughout the World:

“The existence of social protection can be recognized as one of the most significant social achievements of the 20th century.”

- Europe
- The Americas
- Asia
- But in Africa...

Formal sector employment
- Developed countries 84%
- Latin America 63%
- South Asia 21%
- Sub Saharan Africa 23%
Historical situation

- Informal systems
- Patchwork of colonial schemes; social insurance for civil servants (5-10% coverage)
- Supply side investments in public infrastructure & market based interventions that exclude the poor
- Structural adjustment, trade policies
- Emergency food aid, famine relief, humanitarian assistance
- NGO programs: under funded, fragmented, partially implemented, not evaluated
Old Age Pensions

Minimum Age Requirements
Universal or means tested: 62 years

Social Insurance Systems

• Formal sector employment (34)

• Excludes agricultural, domestic, part-time & casual workers

Old Age, Survivor, Disability, Sickness, Unemployment, Family Allowances, Work Injury, Maternity

Social Protection
Why Social Protection?

“The concept and practice of social protection has advanced at an astonishing pace over the last decade. There is a growing consensus that social protection constitutes an effective response to poverty and vulnerability in developing countries, and is an essential component of economic and social development strategies.”

Barrientos and Hulme 2008
http://www.bwpi.manchester.ac.uk/resources/Working-Papers/bwpi-wp-3008.pdf
**Definition: Social Protection**

- Set of policies to reduce poverty & facilitate human capital and economic development
  - Essential services, to ensure availability, continuity and access to public services
  - **Social transfers**, to provide a minimum income security to the world's poorest, most vulnerable

Attributes of Social Protection

**Protective:** to save lives and offer relief from deprivation
- Emergency relief
- Supplementary feeding
- HIV/AIDS support
- Disability allowance
- Unconditional cash transfers

**Preventive:** to avert deprivation
- Crop and weather insurance
- Pensions
- Health insurance
- Unemployment benefits
- Savings clubs
Attributes and examples

**Promotive:** to enhance incomes and capabilities
- Agricultural input distribution or input subsidies
- School feeding schemes that encourage attendance
- Public works schemes that create community assets
- Microenterprise
- ‘Conditional cash transfers’

**Transformative:** to address social equity & exclusion; transform the socio-legal context of work
- Labor market regulation
- Workers’ rights
- Anti-discrimination campaigns
- Promoting awareness of citizens’ rights.
**Fundamental Cause**

**Upstream: Risk factors & determinants**

- Poverty
- Insufficient safety net at greatest time of need

**Downstream: Health consequences**

- Disease
- Mortality, years of life lost
- Under development
Fundamental causes are CONTROVERSIAL!

- Challenge status quo, power bases
- Highlight inequalities and deprivation
- Highlight the lack of rights for vulnerable and minorities

Reform...

- Is big, complicated
- Requires
  - Policymakers, donors to harmonize efforts
  - Sustained effort, funding
  - Priority changing, setting
  - Serious focus on national budgets
- Challenges other macro economic policies
Players & programs:
Social Protection across time and place
Social Protection players

- World Bank, AFDB, ADB, IADB
- SADC, UNRWA, WFP,
- African Union
- Regional Commissions
- DFID, GTZ, SIDA, AUSAID, Irish AID
- Save the Children, other INGOs, NGOs
- USAID
Conditional Cash Transfer Schemes

Schady & Fiszbein 2009
• High quality evaluation and research
• Substantial impacts in sub groups
• Robust and growing literature
Throughout the world

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Scheme</th>
<th>Number of households</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Brazil’s Bolsa Familia</td>
<td>12 million</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mexico’s Oportunidades (1997)</td>
<td>5 million</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South Africa’s Child Support Grant (2003)</td>
<td>7.2 million</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>China’s Minimum Living Standards Scheme (1990s)</td>
<td>22.4 million</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indonesia’s Safety Net Scheme (2005)</td>
<td>15 million</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>India’s National Rural Employment Guarantee Scheme</td>
<td>26 million</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Poverty index fell from 43% - 29%
- Extreme poverty fell from 12% - 5%
- Range of health and human development impacts
- Not all programs created equal

Online at worldbank.org
Cash Transfers in Africa 2008

Ranging from US$5 - $30 ($111 in SA) per month
Cash Transfers in Africa 2011

Ranging from US$5 - $30 ($111 in SA) per month

Important Lessons from Pilots
• Impacts
• Implementation
• Scale up
• Testing components

Online at http://childresearchpolicy.org
In summary, wide range of impacts

- Improved food security, diversity, increased stores
- Asset accumulation including basic household necessities, livestock, productive assets
- Greater agricultural production
- Reduced exclusion
- Impacts on local community through hiring of workers, giving of loans, food
- Impacts on local economy and businesses

- Reduced malnutrition in young children
- Increased growth in older children
- Reduced number and severity of illnesses
- Greater access to health services
- Increased school enrolment
- Reduced absences
- Decreased child work
- Greater hope, wellness, optimism for future

Available online at http://childresearchpolicy.org
Challenges
Systems are lacking

- For building social protection policies
  - Capacity of African intelligentsias to debate policy choices and implementation options

- Design and implement ‘when times are bad’
  - Global economic crisis
  - HIV/AIDS, Conflict
  - Complex emergencies
Implementation challenges

Governments lack capacity to implement

- Human resources (management and technical skills)
- Infrastructure
- Technology, automation
- Equipment
- Monitoring activities
- Quality control
- Measuring to reduce fraud, errors and corruption
Heated debates:

- Which programs to implement?
- Optimal program design
- Program components
- Size vs. number of recipients
- Targeting methodology
- What should SP programs be linked to? Cash-plus?
- Conditionality (Human rights or behavior incentive)
- Issues of scale
Financing: Question of priorities

- Public health: Calculate the cost of not having SP for all
- SP does appear to lead to economic growth

- 2% of global GDP for cash transfers
- 6% for set of basic benefits

Costing studies
  - Arica: (Pal et al., 2005)
  - Asia: (Mizunoya et al., 2006).

- Who pays with limited tax structure?

- SSA’s social protection likely to be heavily dependent on donor design and financing.
Sustainability, depends on

- Government and donor commitment, political support for schemes
- Developing government capacity to implement and monitor
Looking ahead
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Activity</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Raising awareness</td>
<td>Identify key stakeholders and relevant actors at the national and international level</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National SPF task force</td>
<td>Establish a national SPF task force composed of key experts and decision-makers and supported by UN SPF country teams</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social protection stocktaking</td>
<td>Map the actual social protection situation and compile available data on existing schemes and coverage gaps; Collect key data that is lacking</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Elaboration of measures</td>
<td>Identify viable policy and/or reform options; Elaborate country-specific SPF policies through national dialogue</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Analysis</td>
<td>Evaluate the cost of policy options; Evaluate the long-term financial sustainability; Reconsider measures in light of costing, reconsider costs in light of needs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Implementation</td>
<td>Build national consensus on a specific SPF framework; Build up national delivery capacities; Support the national budget available for sustainable financing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Monitoring</td>
<td>Implement a monitoring, evaluation and reporting mechanism</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
How can BU advance Social Protection in the 21st Century?

- Conceptualization of social protection links
  - Health
  - Education
  - Agricultural production
- Development studies
- Grant writing
- Program implementation
- Critical appraisal of evidence
- Research methods
- Evaluation sciences
- Economic evaluation
- Policy making
- Public management
- Coalition building
- Technology for resource poor settings
- Communications
- Gender analysis
Social Protection for Africa
A defining force in the 21st century

Dr. Candace Miller, BUSPH, CGHD
Resources
Reports


- ILO. 2008. Can low income countries afford basic social security? 
  http://www.socialsecurityextension.org/gimi/gess/RessShowRessource.do?ressourceId=5951

  www.icsw.org/doc/SPF/8_Taylor_Africa_SPFI_Workshop_HK10Jun10.doc AN OVERVIEW OF SOCIAL PROTECTION IN AFRICA DRAFT REPORT TO THE AFRICAN UNION
Organizations

- Global Extension of Social Security Social Protection Floor Initiative
- Institute of Development Studies Centre for Social Protection [http://www.ids.ac.uk/](http://www.ids.ac.uk/)
- ILO [http://www.ilo.org](http://www.ilo.org)
- DFID [http://www.dfid.gov.uk](http://www.dfid.gov.uk)